Post publication peer review
- A chance to improve the publication process and scientific literature quality?

Dr. Nuria Plattner

UNIVERSITY LIBRARY BERN
Nuria Plattner, Aline Frank, Michael Horn, and Silvan Christen
www.ub.unibe.ch/research/fachinformationen/portal_natural_sciences
Scientific publication process
The role of peer review

Peer review process
1.) Editor assessment
2.) Paper sent to reviewers
3.) Reviewer reports (accept, revise or reject)
4.) Answer to reviewers and paper revision
5.) Reviewer/Editor assessment of revised paper
6.) Paper accepted or further review

New research based on result
Scientific publication process
Post publication peer review: Option A)

Peer review process
1.) Editor assessment
2.) Paper sent to reviewers
3.) Reviewer reports (accept, revise or reject)
4.) Answer to reviewers and paper revision
5.) Reviewer/Editor assessment of revised paper
6.) Paper accepted or further review

Scientific result

Manuscript

Scientific result

Post publication peer review
Comments/discussion or reviewer reports of published paper
Post publication peer review platforms

PubPeer

- The PubPeer platform allows comments on any article
- For starting comments on a new article, use a unique identifier
- Comments can be made anonymously and address major or minor issues of a paper
- Authors are alerted automatically if there are comments on their paper

@ https://pubpeer.com
PubPeer

Anonymous commenting legal battle

- 2013 anonymous PubPeer comments led to the retraction of several papers of a Univ. Michigan researcher due to falsified data

- 2014 the researcher sued the commenters for defamation trying to reveal their identity

- 2015 the court decided in favor of PubPeer and anonymous commenting

https://retractionwatch.com/2016/08/12/meet-the-researcher-who-tried-to-take-on-pubpeer-commenters-fazlul-sarkar/
Post publication peer review platforms

Plos One

• Open-Access peer reviewed Journal

• Commenting possible for registered users

• Comments should add to the research or make clarifications

@ https://journals.plos.org/plosone/
Discontinued platforms

PubMed

- PubMed launched a commenting platform with only real names for commenting allowed
- Comments could be added by Authors of PubMed papers or upon invitation
- Platform discontinued for lack of engagement

https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-018-01591-4
Scientific publication process

Post publication peer review: options A) and B)

Peer review process
1.) Editor assessment
2.) Paper sent to reviewers
3.) Reviewer reports (accept, revise or reject)
4.) Answer to reviewers and paper revision
5.) Reviewer/Editor assessment of revised paper
6.) Paper accepted or further review

Scientific publication

Post publication peer review
Comments/discussion of published paper

Final publication
Publish before peer review
Faculty of 1000 open peer review

- F1000Research: open-access platform for biology and medicine
- Papers are published before peer review
- Referees are invited and peer reviewers’ names and comments are visible
- Data is downloadable in addition to articles
- Negative results can also be published

@ https://f1000research.com
Preprints in the scientific publication process

Post publication peer review

- Commenting on preprints can be a form of post publication peer review
- No strict guidelines for commenting
- **BioRxiv**: 12% of non-author comments are full review reports
Discussion / Conclusions

Post publication peer review

- Aim of post publication peer review: allow broad discussion on scientific articles and improve scientific literature quality

Open peer review can take place after the conventional publishing process, as an alternative to the conventional peer review process or in parallel to a formal peer review

- Various platforms for different post publication peer review schemes

- Can these tools help to improve the publication process?
Thanks for your attention

Questions?

Coffee & Bit(e)s
THE COFFEE LECTURES FOR SCIENTISTS

UNIVERSITY LIBRARY BERN
Nuria Plattner, Aline Frank, Michael Horn, and Silvan Christen
www.unibe.ch/ub/sciencelibrary